IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF OKLAHOMA

STATE OF OKLAHOMA,)
)
Plaintiff,)
)
v.	Case No. 05-cv-329-GKF(PJC)
)
TYSON FOODS, INC., et al.,)
)
Defendants.	.)

STATE OF OKLAHOMA'S RESPONSE IN OPPOSITION TO "CARGILL DEFENDANTS' MOTION FOR ADDITIONAL TIME TO PRODUCE EXPERT FATE AND TRANSPORT REPORT" [DKT #1829]

Plaintiff, the State of Oklahoma ("the State"), respectfully submits this response in opposition to "Cargill Defendants' Motion for Additional Time to Produce Expert Fate and Transport Report" [DKT #1829]. The Cargill Defendants' Motion fails to establish "good cause" for modification of the scheduling order to allow the Cargill Defendants additional time to disclose their unidentified expert's fate and transport report, and as such it should be denied. Specifically:

- 1. The Cargill Defendants have received multiple extensions of time for disclosure of their expert reports. See DKT #1376, #1658, #1706, #1756 & #1805. The Cargill Defendants have known since November 21, 2008, that this report was to be disclosed on January 23, 2009, and yet it was only on the date their expert's report was due that they brought their request for an extension to the State and the Court.
- 2. Attendance by an attorney at an overseas conference is hardly a valid excuse for not meeting a long-scheduled expert disclosure deadline. In this age of cell phone and e-mail communication the Cargill Defendants' attorney could have, even while overseas, worked with the expert on "completion of the report in proper form for delivery." See Cargill Defendants'

Motion, p. 2. Moreover, the Cargill Defendants' Motion lists no fewer than five other attorneys representing the Cargill Defendants. Surely one of these attorneys could have likewise shepherded the report to completion.

- 3. The Cargill Defendants' Motion speaks of the overseas conference being "an unavoidable scheduling conflict[]," *see* Cargill Defendants' Motion, p. 2, although it offers no evidentiary support that it was indeed "unavoidable" or unforeseen. In fact, it was not until January 23, 2009 -- the same day that the expert disclosure was due -- that the Cargill Defendants brought their request for an extension to the State's attention.
- 4. The request for a one-week extension is excessive in light of the Cargill Defendants' representation that what apparently remains is merely formatting of the expert disclosure. *See* Cargill Defendants' Motion, p. 2 ("Counsel has been unable to provide necessary assistance for completion of the report *in proper form for delivery*") (emphasis added).

Accordingly, the Cargill Defendants' Motion should be denied.

Respectfully Submitted,

W.A. Drew Edmondson OBA # 2628 ATTORNEY GENERAL Kelly H. Burch OBA #17067 J. Trevor Hammons OBA #20234 Daniel P. Lennington OBA #21577 ASSISTANT ATTORNEYS GENERAL State of Oklahoma 313 N.E. 21st St. Oklahoma City, OK 73105 (405) 521-3921

s/Robert A. Nance

M. David Riggs OBA #7583
Joseph P. Lennart OBA #5371
Richard T. Garren OBA #3253
Sharon K. Weaver OBA #19010
Robert A. Nance OBA #6581
D. Sharon Gentry OBA #15641
David P. Page OBA #6852
RIGGS, ABNEY, NEAL, TURPEN,
ORBISON & LEWIS
502 West Sixth Street
Tulsa, OK 74119
(918) 587-3161

Louis W. Bullock OBA #1305 Robert M. Blakemore OBA 18656 BULLOCK, BULLOCK & BLAKEMORE 110 West Seventh Street Suite 707 Tulsa OK 74119 (918) 584-2001

Frederick C. Baker (admitted *pro hac vice*)
Lee M. Heath (admitted *pro hac vice*)
Elizabeth C. Ward (admitted *pro hac vice*)
Elizabeth Claire Xidis (admitted *pro hac vice*)
MOTLEY RICE, LLC
28 Bridgeside Boulevard
Mount Pleasant, SC 29465 (843) 216-9280

William H. Narwold (admitted *pro hac vice*) Ingrid L. Moll (admitted *pro hac vice*) MOTLEY RICE, LLC 20 Church Street, 17th Floor Hartford, CT 06103 (860) 882-1676 Jonathan D. Orent (admitted *pro hac vice*) Michael G. Rousseau (admitted *pro hac vice*) Fidelma L. Fitzpatrick (admitted *pro hac vice*) MOTLEY RICE, LLC 321 South Main Street Providence, RI 02940 (401) 457-7700

Attorneys for the State of Oklahoma

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on this <u>26th</u> day of January, 2009, I electronically transmitted the above and foregoing pleading to the Clerk of the Court using the ECF System for filing and a transmittal of a Notice of Electronic Filing to the following ECF registrants:

W. A. Drew Edmondson, Attorney General Kelly H. Burch, Assistant Attorney General J. Trevor Hammons, Assistant Attorney General Daniel P. Lennington, Assistant Attorney General fc_docket@oag.state.ok.us Kelly_burch@oag.state.ok.us trevor_hammons@oag.state.ok.us daniel.lennington@oag.ok.gov

M. David Riggs
Joseph P. Lennart
Richard T. Garren
Sharon K. Weaver
Robert A. Nance
D. Sharon Gentry
David P. Page

driggs@riggsabney.com jlennart@riggsabney.com rgarren@riggsabney.com sweaver@riggsabney.com rnance@riggsabney.com sgentry@riggsabney.com dpage@riggsabney.com

RIGGS, ABNEY, NEAL, TURPEN, ORBISON & LEWIS

Louis Werner Bullock Robert M. Blakemore BULLOCK, BULLOCK & BLAKEMORE lbullock@bullock-blakemore.com bblakemore@bullock-blakemore.com

Frederick C. Baker Lee M. Heath Elizabeth C. Ward Elizabeth Claire Xidis William H. Narwold Ingrid L. Moll Jonathan D. Orent Michael G. Rousseau Fidelma L. Fitzpatrick fbaker@motleyrice.com lheath@motleyrice.com lward@motleyrice.com cxidis@motleyrice.com bnarwold@motleyrice.com imoll@motleyrice.com jorent@motleyrice.com mrousseau@motleyrice.com ffitzpatrick@motleyrice.com

MOTLEY RICE, LLC

Counsel for State of Oklahoma

Robert P. Redemann rredemann@pmrlaw.net
Lawrence W. Zeringue lzeringue@pmrlaw.net
David C. Senger dsenger@pmrlaw.net
PERRINE, MCGIVERN, REDEMANN, REID, BARRY & TAYLOR, P.L.L.C.

Robert E Sanders rsanders@youngwilliams.com
Edwin Stephen Williams steve.williams@youngwilliams.com

YOUNG WILLIAMS P.A.

Counsel for Cal-Maine Farms, Inc and Cal-Maine Foods, Inc.

John H. Tucker jtucker@rhodesokla.com
Theresa Noble Hill thill@rhodesokla.com
Colin Hampton Tucker ctucker@rhodesokla.com
Leslie Jane Southerland ljsoutherland@rhodesokla.com

RHODES, HIERONYMUS, JONES, TUCKER & GABLE

Terry Wayen West terry@thewestlawfirm.com

THE WEST LAW FIRM

Delmar R. Ehrich dehrich@faegre.com
Bruce Jones bjones@faegre.com
Krisann C. Kleibacker Lee kklee@faegre.com
Todd P. Walker twalker@faegre.com
Christopher H. Dolan cdolan@faegre.com

FAEGRE & BENSON, LLP

Dara D. Mann dmann@mckennalong.com

MCKENNA, LONG & ALDRIDGE, LLP

Counsel for Cargill, Inc. & Cargill Turkey Production, LLC

James Martin Graves jgraves@bassettlawfirm.com
Gary V Weeks gweeks@bassettlawfirm.com
Paul E. Thompson, Jr pthompson@bassettlawfirm.com
Woody Bassett wbassettlawfirm.com
K. C. Dupps Tucker kctucker@bassettlawfirm.com

BASSETT LAW FIRM

George W. Owens gwo@owenslawfirmpc.com Randall E. Rose gwo@owenslawfirmpc.com

OWENS LAW FIRM, P.C.

Counsel for George's Inc. & George's Farms, Inc.

A. Scott McDaniel smcdaniel@mhla-law.com
Nicole Longwell nlongwell@mhla-law.com
Philip Hixon phixon@mhla-law.com
Craig A. Merkes cmerkes@mhla-law.com

MCDANIEL, HIXON, LONGWELL & ACORD, PLLC

Sherry P. Bartley sbartley@mwsgw.com

MITCHELL, WILLIAMS, SELIG, GATES & WOODYARD, PLLC

Counsel for Peterson Farms, Inc.

John Elrod jelrod@cwlaw.com
Vicki Bronson vbronson@cwlaw.com
P. Joshua Wisley jwisley@cwlaw.com
Bruce W. Freeman bfreeman@cwlaw.com
D. Richard Funk rfunk@cwlaw.com

CONNER & WINTERS, LLP Counsel for Simmons Foods, Inc.

Stephen L. Jantzensjantzen@ryanwhaley.comPaula M. Buchwaldpbuchwald@ryanwhaley.comPatrick M. Ryanpryan@ryanwhaley.com

RYAN, WHALEY, COLDIRON & SHANDY, P.C.

Mark D. Hopsonmhopson@sidley.comJay Thomas Jorgensenjjorgensen@sidley.comTimothy K. Webstertwebster@sidley.comThomas C. Greentcgreen@sidley.comGordon D. Toddgtodd@sidley.com

SIDLEY, AUSTIN, BROWN & WOOD LLP

Robert W. George robert.george@tyson.com
L. Bryan Burns bryan.burns@tyson.com

TYSON FOODS, INC

Michael R. Bond michael.bond@kutakrock.com
Erin W. Thompson erin.thompson@kutakrock.com

KUTAK ROCK, LLP

Counsel for Tyson Foods, Inc., Tyson Poultry, Inc., Tyson Chicken, Inc., & Cobb-Vantress, Inc.

R. Thomas Lay rtl@kiralaw.com

KERR, IRVINE, RHODES & ABLES

Jennifer Stockton Griffin jgriffin@lathropgage.com

David Gregory Brown LATHROP & GAGE LC

Counsel for Willow Brook Foods, Inc.

Robin S Conrad rconrad@uschamber.com

NATIONAL CHAMBER LITIGATION CENTER

Gary S Chilton gchilton@hcdattorneys.com

HOLLADAY, CHILTON AND DEGIUSTI, PLLC

Counsel for US Chamber of Commerce and American Tort Reform Association

D. Kenyon Williams, Jr. kwilliams@hallestill.com Michael D. Graves mgraves@hallestill.com

HALL, ESTILL, HARDWICK, GABLE, GOLDEN & NELSON

Counsel for Poultry Growers/Interested Parties/ Poultry Partners, Inc.

Richard Ford richard.ford@crowedunlevy.com
LeAnne Burnett leanne.burnett@crowedunlevy.com

CROWE & DUNLEVY

Counsel for Oklahoma Farm Bureau, Inc.

Kendra Akin Jones, Assistant Attorney General Kendra.Jones@arkansasag.gov Charles L. Moulton, Sr Assistant Attorney General Charles.Moulton@arkansasag.gov

Counsel for State of Arkansas and Arkansas National Resources Commission

Mark Richard Mullins richard.mullins@mcafeetaft.com

MCAFEE & TAFT

Counsel for Texas Farm Bureau; Texas Cattle Feeders Association; Texas Pork Producers

Association and Texas Association of Dairymen

Mia Vahlberg @gablelaw.com

GABLE GOTWALS

James T. Banks jtbanks@hhlaw.com Adam J. Siegel ajsiegel@hhlaw.com

HOGAN & HARTSON, LLP

Counsel for National Chicken Council; U.S. Poultry and Egg Association & National Turkey

Federation

John D. Russell jrussell@fellerssnider.com

FELLERS, SNIDER, BLANKENSHIP, BAILEY & TIPPENS, PC

William A. Waddell, Jr. waddell@fec.net
David E. Choate dchoate@fec.net

FRIDAY, ELDREDGE & CLARK, LLP

Counsel for Arkansas Farm Bureau Federation

Barry Greg Reynolds reynolds@titushillis.com
Jessica E. Rainey jrainey@titushillis.com
TITUS, HILLIS, REYNOLDS, LOVE,

DICKMAN & MCCALMON

Nikaa Baugh Jordan njordan@lightfootlaw.com William S. Cox, III wcox@lightfootlaw.com

LIGHTFOOT, FRANKLIN & WHITE, LLC

Counsel for American Farm Bureau and National Cattlemen's Beef Association

Also on this <u>26th</u> day of January, 2009, I mailed a copy of the above and foregoing pleading to the following:

David Gregory Brown

Lathrop & Gage, LC 314 E. High Street Jefferson City, MO 65101

Thomas C. Green

Sidley Austin Brown & Wood, LLP 1501 K St. NW Washington, DC 20005

Cary Silverman Victor E. Schwartz Shook Hardy & Bacon LLP 600 14th St. NW, Ste. 800 Washington, DC 20005-2004

J. D. Strong

Secretary of the Environment State of Oklahoma 3800 North Classen Oklahoma City, OK 73118

Dustin McDaniel Justin Allen

Office of the Attorney General (Little Rock) 323 Center Street, Suite 200 Little Rock, AR 72201-2610

Steven B. Randall

58185 County Road 658 Kansas, Ok 74347

George R. Stubblefield

HC 66, Box 19-12 Proctor, Ok 74457

s/Robert A. Nance

Robert A. Nance